



November 4, 2002

Ms. Alice Cardozo
Assistant Disclosure Officer
Texas Workforce Commission
101 E. 15th Street
Austin, Texas 78778-0001

OR2002-6279

Dear Ms. Cardozo:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 171610.

The Texas Workforce Commission (the "commission") received a request for a copy of all proposals received by the commission in response to a specified request for proposals, including all evaluation documents used to rate the proposals and the rank ordering of the proposals after evaluation. You state that the commission takes no position regarding this matter. However, you claim that the responsive information may be subject to third-party confidentiality claims. You have notified the interested third parties of the request for information pursuant to section 552.305 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in Chapter 552 of Government Code in certain circumstances).

Initially, we note that the submitted information does not include any evaluation documents used to rate the proposals and the rank ordering of the proposals after evaluation. To the extent that documents exist that are responsive to this portion of the request for information, they must be released to the requestor. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.006, .301, .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (noting that if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

In regard to the submitted information, an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld

from public disclosure. See Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this decision, one party has stated that it does not object to the release of its information. None of the remaining interested third parties have submitted to this office any reasons explaining why their information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude that any of the submitted information relating to these third parties is excepted from disclosure. See Gov't Code § 552.110(b) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual or evidentiary material, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that it actually faces competition and that substantial competitive injury would likely result from disclosure); Open Records Decision Nos. 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3 (1990).

However, the submitted information contains e-mail addresses of members of the public that may be excepted from disclosure. Section 552.137 of the Government Code makes certain e-mail addresses confidential and provides in relevant part:

- (a) An e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under this chapter.
- (b) Confidential information described by this section that relates to a member of the public may be disclosed if the member of the public affirmatively consents to its release.

Accordingly, unless consent to release has been granted, you must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code. All remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



W. Montgomery Meitler
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

WMM/lmt

Ref: ID# 171610

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Lloyd A. Behm
Program Specialist
Brazos Valley Employer Coalition
P.O. Drawer 851
Brenham, Texas 77834-0851
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Louann Aponte
Austin Families, Inc.
1301 Capital of Texas Highway
Suite C21
Austin, Texas 78746
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Sandra L. Hartnitt
Weatherford College
225 College Park Drive
Weatherford, Texas 76086
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Betty Purkey
Work Friendly
4621 Ross Avenue
Dallas, Texas 75204
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Jennifer Lindsey
Texas Migrant Council, Inc.
P. O. Box 2579
Laredo, Texas 78041
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Misty Francis
Bank of America
6101 South Broadway Avenue
Tyler, Texas 75703
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Amanda A. Cantu
Texas Migrant Council, Inc.
Child Care Management Services
4603 Maher Street
Laredo, Texas 78041
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Norman Robbins
Corporate Champions for Children
2700 Meacham Boulevard
Fort Worth, Texas 76137
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Cisa Rivera
Management, Technical, and Marketing Services
5805 Via Cuesta
El Paso, Texas 79912
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Dawn White
Family Service Association of San Antonio, Inc.
230 Pedreida Street
San Antonio, Texas 78210
(w/o enclosures)